Application of Evaluation Results from Educational Supervision in Promoting Government to Fulfill Educational Responsibilities: Analysis based on Educational Supervision System and Reform Practice in China

Su Junyang
Center for Research on Educational Supervision
Beijing Normal University

Niu Xuan
Graduate Student of Doctoral Course
The United Graduate School of Education
Tokyo Gakugei University.

Abstract: The results of educational supervision in China are mainly used for five purposes: grade ranking, merit award, standard-attaining acceptance, problem diagnosis and decision-making consultation. The Chinese government takes on five basic educational responsibilities: macro-planning, quality assurance, equality assurance, funding assurance and overall coordination. The use of supervisory evaluation results has both normative and developmental values. Different ways of using the results of supervisory evaluation play different roles in promoting the government to fulfill its educational responsibilities. In order to better promote the government to fulfill its educational responsibilities, the use of supervisory results in the future should be conducive to ensuring the improvement of school-running quality and promoting the realization of schools' connotative development. The use of the administrative supervision results should be propitious to promote the improvement the modern level of educational governance system and governance ability. The use of supervisory evaluation results should be in favor of ensuring the scientific decision-making level of governments at all levels and improving the quality of school running.

Keywords: educational supervision; evaluation results; governmental responsibility on education; fulfillment of educational responsibility
In order to give full play to the function of provincial governments on educational overall planning, the State Council of China issued a circular entitled "Measures for Evaluating the Fulfillment of Educational Responsibilities of Provincial Governments" in 2017, aiming to promote provincial governments to fulfill their relevant responsibilities in education, improve the quality of education, promote equal access to education, and enhance the ability of education to serve economic and social development. The evaluation mainly involves the implementation of the Party's educational policies by the provincial governments, the implementation of educational laws, regulations, rules and policies, the development of education at all levels, the overall promotion of educational work in their respective administrative regions, the strengthening of educational security, and the standardization of school-running behavior by schools. The Measures stipulate that the evaluation results shall be taken as an important basis for assessing, reward and punishing the leading bodies and cadres of the provincial governments and their relevant departments. Then, how to ensure the objectivity of the evaluation results, so that make them play better roles in promoting the government to fulfill its educational responsibilities -- this is a problem worthy of serious study by Chinese academia and practitioners.

1. Evaluation results of educational supervision: Previous applications

There are many ways to apply the evaluation results of educational supervision. Previous applications of such results can be summarized as follows:

1.1 Grade ranking

Grade ranking is an application of such results mainly using the original scores as the basis for delimitation. Grades can be set in a number of ways, some of which are given directly by the evaluator, and some of which are determined according to the pre-set number for each grade after the evaluator has given the original scores. The latter is more scientific and reasonable than the former.

As for the grade ranking, there should be comparability between the objects that need to be supervised and evaluated. Otherwise, the grade ranking will be unscientific. In order to rank, we need to consider not only whether the objects to be evaluated are comparable, but also how to make the ranking reasonable. Generally speaking, there should not be too much grade delimitation, otherwise, the grade delimitation will get no meaning.

1.2 Merit award

Merit award is a special form of the application involved in grade ranking, which has a variety of counting methods. Based on the original score, in the hundred-mark system, those more than 90 points are usually called excellent. Some adopt the percentage for merit scoring, and the percentage of merit is also different at different grades that have been determined. In general, if five grades are defined, the top 20% are rated as excellent. If three grades are defined, the top 30% are rated as excellent. Of course, some also determine the proportion or number of outstanding performances according to the size of the reward ability without using the percentage method.

Some merits are merely honorary titles, while others are given material rewards in
addition to honorary titles.

1.3 Standard-attaining acceptance

Standard-attaining acceptance is one of the main ways to use the results of administrative supervision, which is mainly applied in special supervision. Such results are often used in conjunction with grade ranking and merit awards.

Standard-attaining acceptance is not only conducive to the evaluation of policy benefits, but also taking on benchmarking significance for weak schools. Standard-attaining acceptance is conducive to improving the normative level of school running, enhancing the self-improvement and development ability of weak schools, and establishing the school development support system. In addition, it also has benchmarking significance and normative promotion significance for regions and provinces with backward education.

In China, the acceptance of two basics (basic popularization of nine-year compulsory education and basic elimination of illiteracy among young and middle-aged people) and the acceptance of balanced development of compulsory education are all this way of using the results. Standard-attaining acceptance has a strong sense of administrative orientation.

1.4 Problem diagnosis

Fundamentally, problem diagnosis is not to find the problems existing in regional education management and school running, but to find a breakthrough for regional and school development through the diagnosis and exploration of problems, based on which to establish the basic measures and directions for school development and action. Problem diagnosis has been widely used in the administrative supervision and educational inspection. Problem diagnosis can be carried out both quantitatively and qualitatively, but generally qualitative analysis is the main method. Because it is difficult for quantitative analysis to find the root cause.

Comprehensive supervision and evaluation for schools is a way to evaluate all aspects of school work as a whole, where the results can be used for administrative supervision and educational inspection. Problem diagnosis is an important task involved in comprehensive supervision and evaluation of school.

1.5 Decision-making consultation

In addition to the applications mentioned above, the evaluation results of supervision can be applied in education management and decision-making consultation for school education. In the process of evaluation for educational supervision, all the data and information collected have the significance and values for decision-making consultation. But not all the data and information collected will be used in decision-making consultation.

Those that can be used are featured with reliability, where data and information without reliability cannot be used in decision-making consultation; and big data or representativeness, where the larger the data scale is, the more favorable it is to ensure the scientificity and correctness of decision-making. If the ability of collecting data and information is limited, it is necessary to ensure that the data and information collected are representative, otherwise it is not easy to be used in decision-making consultation.

The five methods above can be used independently or in combination. As using the educational supervision results, different ways are often mixed.
2. Significance and values of applying results of supervisory evaluation to promote the government fulfilling its educational responsibilities

The report of the 18th National Congress of the Communist Party of China clearly pointed out that we should promote the transformation of government functions towards creating a good environment for development, providing high-quality public services and safeguarding social equality and justice, and further clarified the direction for future development of education and the basic responsibilities of government on education. Reasonable application of the results from supervisory evaluation is of great significance and value to ensure the effective implementation of the government's responsibilities on education.

2.1 Governmental responsibilities on education

The congratulatory message delivered by General Secretary Xi Jinping, China's national leader, at the first anniversary of the United Nations Global Initiative "Education First", pointed out that China will firmly implement the strategy of rejuvenating the country through science and education, always place education at the strategic position enjoying the priority to development, continuously expand investment, strive to develop universal education and lifelong education, build a learning society and strive to make every child enjoy access to education, and strive to make 1.3 billion people enjoy better and more equitable education. In fact, General Secretary Xi Jinping has made a clear explanation of the basic educational responsibilities undertaken by Chinese government. Government's educational responsibility is the responsibility that must be fulfilled by the government in the process of ensuring and promoting the development of education. The educational responsibilities of the government are public, important and must be acted upon. To be specific, the portfolio of government educational responsibilities should include the following aspects:

2.1.1 Macro-planning

The development of education serves the construction of a country and society. At present, China has entered a new era of socialist construction with Chinese characteristics, which puts forward new requirements and challenges for the development of China's education. Government should make a good macro-planning for the direction that education will develop. The formulation of the government's macro-planning shall be based on the aims and principles of education, follow the basic laws and requirements of the development of education, and meet the needs of socialist construction with Chinese characteristics in the new era. Macro-planning made by the government in the developmental course of education has stage-based characteristics. In the process of planning implementation, in addition to providing some safeguard measures, the government shall also do a good job in guidance and monitoring.

Government should ensure the right direction of planning for educational undertakings. Moreover, the planning shall be macroscopical rather than microscopical, and there shall be effective and clear safeguard measures.

2.1.2 Funding assurance

The level of investment will directly affect the scale of education development, which will also have an indirect impact on the improvement of education quality. Ensuring the appropriate scale of development of education and improving the quality of education all require sufficient funds. Investment in education funds mainly come from two channels,
including official channel, that is, the government financial investment, and non-governmental channel. Investment in education funds from the non-governmental channel mainly take two forms: one is social school-running, the other is educational donation. The government should maintain the appropriate proportion and scale of financial expenditure on education in line with requirements on scale and quality of educational development in different periods. In addition, we should encourage and fully mobilize the enthusiasm of social forces in running schools, establish a sound donation system for educational funds, expand the channels for private funds to flow into education, and vigorously enhance the ability and level of investment in educational funds. There are requirements not only on the scale of funding guarantee, but also on the efficiency and benefit. The efficiency and benefit of using the funds are realized through rational allocation of funds and scientific evaluation.

2.1.3 Overall coordination

Education is a crucial part of the whole social system. Development of education not only needs to coordinate the development of various educational undertakings at all levels within the education system, but also needs to coordinate the developmental relationship between the education system and other social systems. The coordination of relationships within the education system or between the education system and other systems is not a pure self-construction process, which requires the government to play a good role in overall coordination.

In the process of coordinating the development of educational, political, economic and cultural undertakings, the government should, on the one hand, determine the reasonable proportion of investment in education funds. The too small proportion of educational funds is not conducive to the development of education itself. If the proportion of education investment is too high, there will be a developmental imbalance among educational, political, economic and cultural undertakings. On the other hand, the government should rationally allocate human resources in the social system, making the human resources of each system cooperate closely and work together to avoid and resolve conflicts among systems.

In the process of coordinating the development of various educational undertakings at all levels within the education system, the government also needs to coordinate not only financial resources, but also human and material resources.

2.1.4 Quality assurance

Quality is the vital part of education and an important basis for the formation of competitiveness. The quality of education is closely related to the destiny and future of a country and a nation. Therefore, government should take ensuring and improving the quality of education as an important responsibility of its own. There are various forms and ways to guarantee the quality of education, such as guarantee based on human resources, material resources, financial resources and system. Two kinds of strength are in need to support the development of education: one is the support of hard power, which mainly includes human, material and financial resources; the other is the support of soft power, which mainly includes ideas, concepts, technology and so on. In the process of improving the quality of education, the main support that the government can provide is the hard-power support, not the soft-power support. It is not appropriate for government to provide soft-power support, especially providing it directly.
In the process of hard-power guarantee and supply, the government has innate advantages. In addition, the supply of government services is also an essential factor to ensure and improve the quality of education. The supply efficiency of hard power is subjected to the influence of supply mode and level of government services. The government can guarantee and improve the quality of education by setting standards and creating a relaxed institutional environment.

2.1.5 Equality assurance

Guaranteeing social equity is an important prerequisite for the stable operation of social system. Educational equality is the cornerstone of social equality, which is of great significance to the construction and stable operation of social system. Educational equality act as the basis of realizing rational social mobility and stratification. A harmonious and orderly society is a society with reasonable stratification and orderly flow. In the process of social stratification and mobility, education plays a very important role. Reasonable mobility and social stratification are realized through educational equality. Ensuring and realizing educational equality should be a basic responsibility of the government.

Educational equality takes on various forms, but no matter which form it is, it has a certain degree of proportionality. There are two main aspects involved in the government's responsibility for educational equality: one is the equality of investment in education funds; the other is to ensure that everyone has the right or opportunity to receive education. There are two ways to realize educational equality: planned distribution and equal competition.

2.2 Significance and value of the application of supervisory evaluation results

Supervisory evaluation is a professional and technical work. Its purpose is determined by the development needs of education and the will of government organizations. In fact, the process of establishing the government's responsibility on education is to combine the development needs of educational undertakings with the will of government organizations. The application of supervisory evaluation results in the process of promoting the government to fulfill its educational responsibilities mainly has the significance and value on normative and developmental aspects.

2.2.1 Normativity

Normativity includes not only legitimacy (that is, compliance with the provisions and requirements of laws and regulations), but also the validity of human behavior when laws and regulations are absent. Normativity is an important foundation to ensure the development of education. On the one hand, the normativity of educational management behavior needs conscious implementation by the government and other organizations, on the other hand, it needs an effective monitoring mechanism to guarantee. The significance and value of normativity have been fully embodied in the Regulations on Education Supervision. The Regulations stipulate that one of the important purposes of educational supervision is to ensure the implementation of educational laws, regulations, rules and national educational policies, and to ensure the effective implementation of quality education.

Normativity is an important basis for the stable operation of the system, and an important guarantee for the system to achieve institutional development. Rise of
normative problems is related to subjective non-compliance on the one hand, and to the limitation of subjective knowledge and capacity on the other. Whether the former or the latter, specialized organizations, namely supervisory departments, are in need to carry out effective supervision and guidance. Application of the supervisory results aims to ensure the normativity of the government's behavior on educational management and the effective implementation and enforcement of the national goals and policies on education. The purpose of supervisory evaluation has a strong normative orientation, which will determine that the application of the results will inevitably produce corresponding normative significance and value needs. Reasonable use of the results of educational supervision and evaluation is of great significance and value in ensuring the implementation of educational laws, regulations, regulations and national educational policies, as well as the effective implementation of quality education.

2.2.2 Development

The process of development is not only a process of observing norms, but also a process of restructuring and reconstructing norms. There are two modes of development: one is the old-fashioned exhibition mode, which is formed on the basis of existing systems and norms compliance; the other is the innovative development mode, which is formed on the basis of organizational innovation. These two processes are actually the process of normative compliance and reconstruction. Complying with the old-fashioned system is only a prerequisite and basis for development, which will not necessarily bring about development results. The results of development could not be produced without the guarantee of new institutional modes and organizational innovation behaviors. China's Regulations on Education Supervision stipulate that the second important purpose of education supervision is to improve the quality of education, promote educational equality and impel the development of education in scientific ways.

Development needs technical support and timely innovation in respect to system and organizational behavior. This kind of development is sometimes non-institutionalized, which needs to break the institutional constraints and encourage independent innovation. The process of development is not only a process of self-development of the organizational potential, but also a process of obtaining continuous support from external technical and professional forces. School inspection is a team with strong professional and technical strength, which can provide good external support for the development of education. The application of supervisory evaluation results in promoting the development of education is mainly diagnostic, motivating and improving.

3. How to promote the use and focus shift of supervisory results in government's fulfillment of educational responsibility in the future

The Opinions on Deepening the Reform of Educational Supervision and Transforming the Way of Educational Management clearly require that the use system of educational supervision and evaluation monitoring results should be improved to enhance the authority and effectiveness of educational supervision. Now, China's education is in an important period of comprehensively deepening the across-the-board reform in the field of education, when the orientation of the aims, tasks and functions of educational supervision will change accordingly, which will determine the nature and effectiveness on how to use the results of educational supervision. Fundamentally speaking, the primary purpose and interests of educational supervisors and supervised objects should be the
same, but because the use of the evaluation results of educational supervision has a high stake, it will determine that they are prone to form potential contradictions and conflicts in the process of educational supervision and evaluation. If the results of supervisory evaluation are used improperly, not only will the confrontation and conflict between them be further deepened, but also will become more and more recessive. Thus, the rational use of the results coming from supervisory evaluation is of vital importance to realize the fundamental interests of educational supervision and self-interests of the supervised objects. In the future, use of the evaluation results of China's educational supervision should comply with the following principles, whose direction shall be changed on the following aspects.

3.1 How to use of the supervisory evaluation results
3.1.1 Macro-planning

Planning about educational development plays a crucial role in promoting the development of education. The data collected in the process of supervision and evaluation are not only school data at the micro level, but also regional data at the meso level. These have very important reference value in the formulation of plans on national and regional education and school development. In the future, the central government and local governments can establish a cloud platform for on-line supervisory information management, and combine the construction of cloud platform for on-line supervisory information management with the construction of supervisory database. This can not only innovate the form of supervision, but also effectively improve the efficiency of educational supervision. In addition, these data can be used to regularly analyze the national and regional conditions on the development of education, and provide reliable data support for educational decision-making, especially for the formulation of macro-planning.

In the process of formulating educational development plan, we should fully listen to the opinions of educational stakeholders, especially educational experts. Moreover, more supervisors should be involved in the formulation of macro-planning, and their opinions should be fully solicited and listened to, which is of great significance for ensuring and improving the quality of planning.

3.1.2 Funding assurance

The scale of educational development and the level of economic development are different in different periods. Therefore, the requirements for the government to guarantee the level of investment in education funds are also different in different periods. In 2012, China's financial investment in education has achieved the target of 4% of the gross national product, which has remained unchanged or even larger for the next five years. The reason why this goal can be achieved is that, in a long period of time, government supervisory bodies at all levels regard the guarantee of funds investment as an important task of administrative supervision.

On the premise that education investment is not less than 4% of the gross national product, the results of supervision can be used as a basis for adjusting the proportion of dynamic growth, and also as a basis for rational disposition and allocation of educational funds. Effective use of educational supervision data results can not only ensure the level of investment in education funds, but also ensure the benefit and efficiency of investment in educational funds.
3.1.3 Overall coordination

Education developing in orderly, healthy and coordinated manners requires that governments at all levels are able to effectively and fully fulfill their responsibilities of overall coordination. Governments at different levels can perform different educational responsibilities in respect to overall coordination. The effective exertion of their functions on overall coordination also needs reliable data as the basis.

As for fulfilling the educational responsibilities of overall coordination, government should not only follow the law of education development, but also timely and accurately understand and grasp the dynamic information about education development and the contradictions and problems it faces in the process of development. The purpose will not be achieved if the support of supervised data results are not available for the latter. The data results of educational supervision can provide a solid decision-making reference and basis for the government to fulfill its responsibility of coordinating education as a whole.

3.1.4 Quality assurance

The improvement of education quality is influenced by various factors. The proper use of supervisory evaluation results is conducive to the improvement of education quality.

To improve the quality of education, we need to solve the normative problems involved in educational management and running schools. There are internal norms and external norms for educational management and school-running. External norms mainly refer to national laws and regulations on education, while internal norms mainly refer to those on educational management and internal rules and regulations of school organizations. Ensuring the norms of education management and school running is an important demand for the use of supervisory evaluation results.

Generally speaking, the use of the results of administrative supervision lays stress on its normative function, while the use of the results of educational inspection lays stress on its incentive and guiding function. The use of evaluation monitoring results should focus on the function of diagnosis and decision-making consultation. The proper use of the results coming from administrative supervision, educational inspection and evaluation monitoring is of great significance for ensuring and improving the quality of education.

3.1.5 Equality assurance

There are two forms of equality in education investment: horizontal equality and vertical equality. Horizontal equality means offering the same educational input to the areas or schools under the same conditions. Vertical equality refers to the different treatment given to different areas or schools with different conditions. The distinction of similarities and differences needs to be based on reliable data analysis. The data collected in the supervisory evaluation includes both panel data and cross-sectional data. These data can be used to distinguish the similarities and differences of foundations for regional and school development from the horizontal synchronic and vertical diachronic perspectives. The results of the distinction can provide reliable basis and reference for the determination of the fair proportion and share of education investment.

Fair access to education is affected by family, gender, race, region and other conditions. The results of supervision over educational opportunities can be used as an important basis for redistribution of educational opportunities.
Focus shift in the use of supervisory evaluation results

Administrative supervision, educational inspection and monitoring are three basic tasks and functions of educational supervision in China. In accordance with the development situation and tasks of China's educational undertakings, as well as the adaptable transformation requirements for purpose and function orientation of educational supervision, the use of educational supervision results should undergo the following changes:

3.2.1 The use of the results coming from administrative supervision: Be propitious to promote the improvement the modern level of educational governance system and governance ability.

Administrative supervision mainly solves the problems such as government's inaction, passive action and improper action in education, that is, the effective performing of government's management function. The supervision and evaluation to the government are mostly with the special nature, which mainly supervise the government's performance on educational issues. Thus, use of the results coming from administrative supervision takes on strong rigid requirements, which should give priority to the supervisory function. Deepening the comprehensive reform in the field of education and ensuring the transformation of education towards the mode of connotative development require not only the supervisory function, but also the guiding and incentive function of the administrative supervision in the process of using the results coming from administrative supervision. Previously, the ways in which the results of administrative supervision were used in China are mostly featured with goal-attainment and accountability.

To deepen the comprehensive reform in the field of education, it is necessary to actively transform the functions of the government and actively break through the internal and external institutional obstacles in the development of education, so as to ensure the smooth realization of the mode for connotative development. In the future, use of the results coming from administrative supervision should not only strengthen its rigid requirements for target acceptance, but also strengthen its guiding and promoting functions. Therefore, it is necessary to continuously upgrade the modernization level of China's educational governance capacity on the basis of promoting the establishment of educational governance system and mechanism. Modernization of educational governance capacity includes modernization of governance system, governance mechanism and governance concept. The first thing for the exertion of administrative supervision functions is to solve the problem of modernization of governance system. Otherwise, it will be difficult to realize the modernization of governance concept and mechanism effectively. In the process of improving the modernization level of government governance ability, use of the results coming from administrative supervision is not featured with accountability, but with development, guidance and promotion.

3.2.2 The use of results coming from educational inspection: Be conducive to ensuring the improvement of school-running quality and promoting the realization of schools' connotative development.

At present, the object of educational inspection in China has covered all kinds of schools at all levels. Schools are not only the object of educational inspection, but also the main place for collecting monitoring data of administrative supervision and education-quality monitoring. The core function of educational inspection is to supervise the school,
rather than the administrative issues and monitoring. With the focus of educational management power shifting downward and the establishment of modern educational governance structure system, in particular, educational inspection will play an increasingly important role in the whole educational supervision system. Prior to deepening the comprehensive reform in the field of education, use of the results of educational inspection is mainly featured with grade calibration and inspection acceptance. This way plays a very important role in promoting the extension development with the theme of scale expansion. It is conducive to the supervision and control over the administrative leadership, and ensuring the development of school organizations towards standardization and legalization.

In the era of deepening the comprehensive reform in the field of education, we should actively promote the shift of ways of using the results of educational inspection. Deepening the comprehensive reform in the field of education includes both macro-level reform and micro-level reform, not only including the change of idea, task and content, but also the change of system and mechanism. The key to deepening the comprehensive reform in the field of education is to solve the problems about rationality of setting up the educational management system and positioning its functions, the transformation towards connotation-based educational development and the realization of modernization of educational governance capacity. In order to solve the above problems, it is necessary to give reasonable use to the results of educational inspection. In the process of using the results of educational inspection, we should give full play to its guiding and incentive functions, and weaken its ranking function properly. The use of results coming from educational inspection should focus on ensuring and promoting the self-improvement and development ability of school organizations, and ensuring the smooth realization of national goals and policies on education.

3.2.3 The use of results coming from evaluation monitoring: Be in favor of ensuring the scientific decision-making level of governments at all levels and improving the quality of school running.

The development of information technology has greatly enriched and expanded the meaning and function of data, making the basis for decision-making and technology creation into a new era - the era of big data. Big data has five typical characteristics including volume, velocity, variety, value and veracity. In the process of decision-making for education, using large data can not only carry out horizontal analysis, but also the vertical analysis; not only static analysis, but also dynamic analysis; not only cross-sectional data analysis, but also panel data analysis. Educational monitoring is a supervisory function to monitor and measure the development of education based on quantitative data collection. Sample data formed by educational monitoring can be effectively combined with big data analysis, which will greatly improve the quality of educational decision-making.

Generally speaking, although it is difficult to conduct in-depth qualitative analysis of educational monitoring results, it can provide very reliable data support for educational decision-making. The results of educational monitoring can be used in many aspects. Firstly, scientific research can be carried out to provide theoretical and data support for educational decision-making. Secondly, the supervised objects can be ranked, so that the supervised objects have a clear understanding of their own development stage and position. Thirdly, it provides reliable practice and scientific basis for rewards.
punishments and accountability in management. In the future, the results of educational-quality monitoring will be more and more applied to the improvement of educational decision-making and the improvement of the scientific level of educational decision-making.

**Conclusion**

In order to enhance the effectiveness and authority of the use of educational supervision results, on the one hand, it is necessary to further enhance the administrative status of educational supervision; on the other hand, it is necessary to strengthen the improvement and perfection of the publication methods for the evaluation results of educational supervision. In addition, it is necessary to strengthen the combination of the evaluation results of supervision with the appointment, promotion, ranks, performance evaluation, promotion of titles, accountability, rewards and punishments for cadres in schools and educational management systems, and to further empower the supervisors in the formulation and implementation of development planning, establishment of school improvement programs, formulation of education and training programs, and guidance of education and teaching reform.

**References**


Shi Dengming: Reflections on Several Relations in Education Supervision, Seeking, No. 10, 2016.